

# Planning Committee

## Appeal Decisions

The following decisions have been made by the Planning Inspectorate on appeals arising from decisions of the City

Application Number       **09/00628/FUL**  
Appeal Site               **3 COLLINGWOOD VILLAS, COLLINGWOOD ROAD PLYMOUTH**  
Appeal Proposal          Retention of front gates and railings  
Case Officer              Janine Pomphrey

Appeal Category  
Appeal Type               Written Representations  
Appeal Decision          Dismissed  
Appeal Decision Date    11/12/2009  
Conditions  
Award of Costs    Awarded To

### Appeal Synopsis

The Inspector concluded that the appeal scheme does not preserve the special architectural and historic interest of the listed building. The combined effect of the thickness of the horizontal rails, the ornamentation topping of the vertical panel end rails, the visual impact of the circular motif and its topping scroll work produce an eye catching boundary treatment which does not reflect the apparent Victorian style of the locality nor does it represent a satisfactory contemporary interpretation of the period. Even as a replacement for the former fence, the Inspector had no substantive evidence to conclude that the railings and gates, which impose themselves without precedent upon the streetscene, preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the Stoke Conservation Area. Therefore the Inspector dismissed both appeals (for Planning 09/00628/FUL and Listed Building 09/00630/LBC Consent).

Application Number **09/00630/LBC**  
Appeal Site **3 COLLINGWOOD VILLAS, COLLINGWOOD ROAD PLYMOUTH**  
Appeal Proposal Retention of front gates and railings  
Case Officer Janine Pomphrey

Appeal Category  
Appeal Type Written Representations  
Appeal Decision Dismissed  
Appeal Decision Date 11/12/2009

Conditions  
Award of Costs Awarded To

#### Appeal Synopsis

The Inspector concluded that the appeal scheme does not preserve the special architectural and historic interest of the listed building. The combined effect of the thickness of the horizontal rails, the ornamentation topping of the vertical panel end rails, the visual impact of the circular motif and its topping scroll work produce an eye catching boundary treatment which does not reflect the apparent Victorian style of the locality nor does it represent a satisfactory contemporary interpretation of the period. Even as a replacement for the former fence, the Inspector had no substantive evidence to conclude that the railings and gates, which impose themselves without precedent upon the streetscene, preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the Stoke Conservation Area. Therefore the Inspector dismissed both appeals (for Planning 09/00628/FUL and Listed Building 09/00630/LBC Consent).

#### Note:

Copies of the full decision letters are available to Members in the Ark Royal Room and Plymouth Rooms. Copies are also available to the press and public at the First Stop Reception.